Substitution of doctors by nurses in primary care
Laurant Miranda, Reeves David, Hermens Rosella, Braspenning Jose, Grol Richard, Sibbald Bonnie

Authors' objectives
Background: Demand for primary care services has increased in developed countries due to population ageing, rising patient expectations, and reforms that shift care from hospitals to the community. At the same time, the supply of physicians is constrained and there is increasing pressure to contain costs. Shifting care from physicians to nurses is one possible response to these challenges. The expectation is that nurse-doctor substitution will reduce cost and physician workload while maintaining quality of care.

Objectives: Our aim was to evaluate the impact of doctor-nurse substitution in primary care on patient outcomes, process of care, and resource utilisation including cost. Patient outcomes included: morbidity; mortality; satisfaction; compliance; and preference. Process of care outcomes included: practitioner adherence to clinical guidelines; standards or quality of care; and practitioner health care activity (e.g. provision of advice). Resource utilisation was assessed by: frequency and length of consultations; return visits; prescriptions; tests and investigations; referral to other services; and direct or indirect costs.

Search methods: The following databases were searched for the period 1966 to 2002: Medline; Cinalh; Bids, Embase; Social Science Citation Index; British Nursing Index; HMIC; EPOC Register; and Cochrane Controlled Trial Register. Search terms specified the setting (primary care), professional (nurse), study design (randomised controlled trial, controlled before-and-after-study, interrupted time series), and subject (e.g. skill mix). The searches for this review were conducted in 2002 and are now out-of-date and therefore the review findings should be used with caution. The review is currently being updated and the updated version should be published before the end of 2014.

Selection criteria: Studies were included if nurses were compared to doctors providing a similar primary health care service (excluding accident and emergency services). Primary care doctors included: general practitioners, family physicians, paediatricians, general internists or geriatricians. Primary care nurses included: practice nurses, nurse practitioners, clinical nurse specialists, or advanced practice nurses. Data collection and analysis: Study selection and data extraction was conducted independently by two reviewers with differences resolved through discussion. Meta-analysis was applied to outcomes for which there was adequate reporting of intervention effects from at least three randomised controlled trials. Semi-quantitative methods were used to synthesize other outcomes.

Main results: 4253 articles were screened of which 25 articles, relating to 16 studies, met our inclusion criteria. In seven studies the nurse assumed responsibility for first contact and ongoing care for all presenting patients. The outcomes investigated varied across studies so limiting the opportunity for data synthesis. In general, no appreciable differences were found between doctors and nurses in health outcomes for patients, process of care, resource utilisation or cost. In five studies the nurse assumed responsibility for first contact care for patients wanting urgent consultations during office hours or out-of-hours. Patient health outcomes were similar for nurses and doctors but patient satisfaction was higher with nurse-led care. Nurses tended to provide longer consultations, give more information to patients and recall patients more frequently than did doctors. The impact on physician workload and direct cost of care was variable. In four studies the nurse took responsibility for the ongoing management of patients with particular chronic conditions. The outcomes investigated varied across studies so limiting the opportunity for data synthesis. In general, no appreciable differences were found between doctors and nurses in health outcomes for patients, process of care, resource utilisation or cost.

Authors’ conclusions: The findings suggest that appropriately trained nurses can produce as high quality care as primary care doctors and achieve as good health outcomes for patients. However, this conclusion should be viewed with caution given that only one study was powered to assess equivalence of care, many studies had methodological limitations, and patient follow-up was generally 12 months or less. While doctor-nurse substitution has the potential to reduce doctors' workload and direct healthcare costs, achieving such reductions depends on the particular context of care. Doctors' workload may remain unchanged either because nurses are deployed to meet previously unmet patient need or because nurses generate demand for care where previously there was none. Savings in cost depend on the magnitude of the salary differential between doctors and nurses, and may be offset by the lower productivity of nurses compared to doctors.

Bibliographic details

Accession Number
10000001271

Date abstract record published
13/07/2012

Record Status
This is an abstract for a Cochrane review